| **Student Name:** Catherine Ho |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 67 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I would like a higher impact illustration of segregation - use realistic examples of what kinds of areas these are, and what the separation of different races looks like; are these immigrants, are these indigenous groups, what’s the problem? Why is there a lack of assimilation in the status quo?  Set-up   * Are the stakes of this debate a diverse mindset, or racial tensions? Your framing at the moment is not very high impact. * Does the model extend to private schools? You may want to introduce safeguards - for instance, do you try to maintain the selectivity of existing selective schools or overrule this? * Is this true that there are racially exclusive schools? The language we use also shouldn’t be mixed schools versus normal schools. This is very reductive. * At the end of set-up, I’m still not sure what the problem in the status quo is. Yes, separation exists but why? There’s very little analysis as to why this is true - is it due to ethnic enclaves or what? * We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales.   Argument 1   * What does it mean for segregation to affect the future? What do we mean that they learn to work with other people? This is incredibly vague language. What mechanisms lead to any or specific change? * We need to first explain why there is a correlation between wealth and race. We can use the following analysis to do this; historically, government policies like the Homestead Act, which granted land primarily to white settlers, and the GI Bill, which provided benefits like education and housing loans disproportionately to white veterans, further widened the wealth gap. Continuing practices like redlining and discriminatory lending practices make it harder for people of colour to buy homes, a primary means of wealth accumulation. Disproportionate incarceration rates for Black Americans can lead to lost income, difficulty finding employment, and other economic hardships. * Young people’s mindsets are ‘easy to shift’ - but why do they shift? How does change occur? * What is social cohesion? What does it mean? What does it look like in real life?   There is very little mechanistic analysis in this speech. Catherine, we need to wise up and push hard because we need to at least try to prove the outcome of the argument! I want mechanistic analysis on integration! Explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth.  Why aren’t we taking a POI?  05:58 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Stephanie Kwan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Fair opening; we can go harder and attack the lack of any mechanisation from Prop; pinpoint the problem solution gap. Rather than flipping the argument immediately, by analysing how kids are more likely to react, you should first point out the lack of analysis in proving this outcome. You’re taking the argument too seriously.  Why would you take the POI in the middle of the sentence?  Where is the signposting? Where is the set-up - you jumped straight into rebuttal from the opening. This leads to a messier speech. You have to be more organised.  How likely is it that there is no correlation between race and wealth? Do we want to dispute this?  The POI exchange explains why as 1st Opp, you need to take POIs between rebuttal and your argument, or between your first and second argument… we also took THREE POIs? Why?  You say your model is a better pathway, but at 2:40 I don’t know what this model is.  Is it forced representation or forced assimilation? Do we deny racial tension or racial differences exist?  Argument 1 - at 4:00   * Why our model works isn’t a legitimate title for an argument! * Where do these stereotypes come from? Why is everyone so racist and horrible? You assert these behaviours, rather than building them up. Why do they self select into segregated friend groups? What is the analysis for this? * POI - why do they interact naturally? At the top of your speech you said that kids are immature and don’t get along, but now they will interact? * There’s no mechanisation as to why or how stereotypes go away? Do you just see a person of colour and then stop being racist? How does change occur?   Stephanie, we need to go back to the basics! What is the structure of this speech?  You should push and make this debate about Singapore and Malaysia, where racial tensions are far more acute - talk about the source of the stereotypes and why schooling doesn’t just flip it.  05:52 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Hanson Ko |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidization based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales. Explain to me how these stereotypes or discrimination exists - characterise this as racial tension. Characterise what these societies or communities look like and why racism exists; is it because of hatred, or is it because they have never interacted with them without prejudice? You need to analyse why people are engaged in racism to be able to explain how it goes away.  Why are we ‘extending’? Is this BP? There has to be a second speaker argument, which you call an argument.  Rebuttal   * Likelihood of students’ changing their minds - your response is just repeating the motion, and saying this isn’t representation; is it not? Talk about generational change and differences, and how these societies are changing and **need to change** anyways! * POI: inferiority - good equal footing. Why and how is it equal footing? I want mechanistic analysis on integration! Explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth. * How do we help them? How does change occur - they just go to the school and then their social class changes? Their mindset or attitude changes? Is this exclusively a debate about access to private schools? If so, why is there ‘ethnically heterogeneous’ and ‘multiethnic’ in the motion? This is a debate about alleviating racial tension, rather than about class and social mobility as the big outcome. * What is social cohesion? What does it mean? What does it look like in real life?   I would like a higher impact illustration of segregation - use realistic examples of what kinds of areas these are, and what the separation of different races looks like; are these immigrants, are these indigenous groups, what’s the problem? Why is there a lack of assimilation in the status quo?  The argument (?) which you don’t signpost just says the government needs to act and help these underprivileged people. Will Opp disagree with this?  Why are you rapping? Don’t take two POIs next time!  06:17 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Gwyneth Chan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is this coercive? What is the alternative?  Rebuttal   * Social cohesion; I think we need to ask ourselves what this even means. Analyse why people are racist or segregated in the first place. Why are washing this as the first layer of response? Engage with it on a logic level first! You haven’t actually disproven the argument. * On mixing existing in the status quo - why do they interact naturally? At the top of your speech you said that this is forcing representation and kids are unlikely to respond well? * POI - I don’t know what the model is. Is this a debate about access to resources or about racial tensions….? * Where do these stereotypes come from? Why is everyone so racist and horrible? You assert these behaviours, rather than building them up. Why do they self select into segregated friend groups? What is the analysis for this?   As 2nd Opp, we need to be engaging in more responsive work. We moved on to our argument at 3:20ish…  Argument 1   * Which private schools, which are very exclusive, exist in multiethnic/ethnically heterogenous areas where one or more minority races cannot afford it? Do such neighbourhoods or areas exist? What are these areas and what do they look like? There isn’t a single example in this speech. * Why are these same children going to naturally mix on your side outside of school? * There’s no mechanisation as to why or how stereotypes go away? Do you just see a person of colour and then stop being racist? How does change occur?   I think we have to build up racial tensions - and why they backfire; forced integration can sometimes backfire and exacerbate existing tensions between ethnic groups. If not managed carefully, it can lead to increased conflict and resentment within the school community. A focus on creating inclusive environments within existing schools, regardless of their ethnic makeup, might be a more effective approach.  What’s the positive comparative? How does your side achieve any change?  Our conclusion should not be so summative. Weigh the impacts or solvency instead.  06:05 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ryan Qian |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidization based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I think our opening is very hyperbolic; we should instead explain why the motion is the best way forward, focusing on the solvency of your mech. Impact this out properly - that this is our best chance or only chance - and why taking this chance matters so much. Characterise what these societies or communities look like and why racism exists; is it because of hatred, or is it because they have never interacted with them without prejudice? You need to analyse why people are engaged in racism to be able to explain how it goes away. The social cohesion impact and social mobility impact are getting mixed up and super messy at this point.  You’re speaking so fast you’re muddling up words together. Where is the punctuation in your speaking! Where is your signposting? What are your clashes? What is the structure of your speech? You tell me you have clashes at 3:12, and the responses between your opening and first clash could all have fit into your first clash. It makes for a more repetitive speech.  Rebuttal   * Is this a debate about resources and education, or about racial tension and segregation? Which one is it? The POI gets at this; education is probably something Opp can also provide and say they do. This isn’t exclusive! * Good on private schools and their beliefs of people of colour; explain how change occurs when assimilation and mixing does.   Clash 1: Social Cohesion   * We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales. * Explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth. We reference all these ideas but need to go step by step in explaining how we reach the impact. * Talk about generational change and differences, and how these societies are changing and **need to change** anyways! We mention this, which is good, but we need to unpack this comparatively.   Clash 2: Education   * Is this benefit exclusive to the motion? Or can this be resolved outside the motion specifically. * How do we help them? How does change occur - they just go to the school and then their social class changes? Their mindset or attitude changes? Is this exclusively a debate about access to private schools? If so, why is there ‘ethnically heterogeneous’ and ‘multiethnic’ in the motion? This is a debate about alleviating racial tension, rather than about class and social mobility as the big outcome.   06:12 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Adrien Wong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why does it worsen the situation? This is hyperbolic without any explanation why. Do you think the judge is on your side when you try to exaggerate how bad this is?  After your opening you need to tell me what the structure of your speech will be!  You need to stop and explain this isn’t a debate about education. Education is not contentious. Both sides can provide access to resources to poor people of colour. This is a debate about racial tension.  POI: This is a good question to ask why natural assimilation occurs. Our team never mech-ed this, and we need to! We are simultaneously saying that students are immature and will self segregate in these schools and think the people of colour are inferior, but that outside of the school they will for some reason engage?  Clash 3: Principle?   * We say we have three clashes, but then we start with the third clash first, on the principle? What is the structure of this speech?   Clash 1: Better Education   * Are these schools discriminating on purpose, or is it that wealth and race are correlated and hence this leads to a lack of diversity naturally? Explain why schooling and mixing is insufficient to lead to change! * Why do kids buy into this? Especially when teachers or the government tell them otherwise? Explain why they are more likely to listen to their families etc. * Are such racist societies based in ethnically heterogeneous areas in the first place? I’m confused by this. Which private schools, which are very exclusive, exist in multiethnic/ethnically heterogenous areas where one or more minority races cannot afford it? Do such neighbourhoods or areas exist? What are these areas and what do they look like? There isn’t a single example in this speech.   Clash 2: Racism   * I think we have to build up racial tensions - and why they backfire; forced integration can sometimes backfire and exacerbate existing tensions between ethnic groups. If not managed carefully, it can lead to increased conflict and resentment within the school community. A focus on creating inclusive environments within existing schools, regardless of their ethnic makeup, might be a more effective approach. * What’s the positive comparative? How does your side achieve any change? How do you solve racial tension?   06:06 | | | | | | |